



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

SUMMARIZED MINUTES

Monday, April 8, 2019

**Scottsdale Community Design Studio
7506 E Indian School Road
Scottsdale, Arizona 85251**

PRESENT: Nadia Mustafa, Chair
Janice Shimokubo, Vice Chair
James Eaneman
Emily Hinchman
Stuart Rhoden (telephonic)

STAFF: Sharon Cini
Bill Hylan

GUESTS: Detective Nichole Engstrom

Call to Order/Roll Call

Chair Mustafa called the meeting to order at 5:03 p.m.

Public Comment

There were no members of the public who wished to speak.

1. Approval of minutes from the March 11, 2019 meeting

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE MARCH 11, 2019 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. COMMISSIONER HINCHMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR MUSTAFA, VICE-CHAIR

SHIMOKUBO, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

2. Presentation, discussion and recommendations regarding City of Scottsdale Quarterly Hate Crimes report

Detective Nichole Engstrom presented the hate crimes report for 2018 through first quarter of 2019. She indicated that in 2018 there were two anti-Jewish, one anti-black, one anti-Hispanic, and one anti-lesbian events that reached the level that required reporting to the FBI. So far in 2019, there has been one anti-Jewish hate crime reported in Scottsdale.

Detective Engstrom explained that the majority of Scottsdale's calls are related to criminal damage and cannot be classified as hate crimes, in part, because they cannot be traced back to a target. Scottsdale investigates all crimes under the State of Arizona Statutes, which does not include specific hate crime statutes. What it does include are sentencing statutes that allow for enhanced sentencing for people whose crimes have a hate crime determination. The FBI tracks statistics nationwide so that they can be aware of trends.

Commissioners were given an opportunity to ask questions. Detective Engstrom said that Scottsdale does outreach with neighboring communities regarding hate crime prevention. The police department also works closely with Paiute Community Center to get an accurate depiction of what is happening in the Hispanic community and crimes that might go unreported.

3 Presentation, discussion and recommendation on 2019 Human Relations Commission strategic plan

- Scottsdale for All project updates

Chair Mustafa announced that SUSD has given approval to deliver Scottsdale for All posters to all of the Scottsdale schools. The posters will be delivered to each school with a cover letter. Students and teachers will be encouraged to post pictures with a description of what Scottsdale for All means to them, using the Scottsdale for All hashtag.

Commissioner Hinchman said that she will be contacting the Realtor Board Community Outreach representative about having a Scottsdale for All presentation. She will share contact information with Chair Mustafa so arrangements for a presentation can be made.

Sharon Cini said that the new Scottsdale for All outreach materials were used during the Arizona Bike week event and Exclusively Little Expo. Photographs of those events will be posted on Facebook. She displayed Scottsdale for All handprint canvases made using children's handprints during Exclusively Little and asked Commissioners to consider ideas for creative ways to use them.

- Dinner & Dialogue

Commissioner Rhoden gave an update on the recent Dinner and Dialogue event, thanking Rachel and Mike Pearson for hosting the event in their home. He suggested that consideration be given to extending the time on future events and noted that there are already enough people interested in participating to hold two events in the fall. Posts were placed on LinkedIn and Office of Diversity Facebook and they received positive feedback.

Discussion ensued regarding suggestions for structuring future Dinner and Dialogue events and the idea of writing an article about the Dinner and Dialogue as well as Scottsdale for All for the Scottsdale Independent.

The Regional HRC meeting will be modeled as a Dinner and Dialogue and will follow the same timeline as the meeting that was cancelled last year. Commissioners will receive a facilitation training refresher during the May meeting.

- Golden Rule

Commissioner Hinchman reiterated that the Golden Rule event will be inclusive of all who are interested in participating, including the Interfaith Community. She stressed that Golden Rule is about being kind and treating each other right. the planning committee hopes to keep the event lighter than the past event, so that people of all backgrounds will be encouraged to participate.

Commissioner Hinchman noted that the CEO of the Be Kind organization has volunteered to be part of the planning committee. It is hoped that through the connection with the Be Kind organization, connections can be made with a variety of high profile organizations.

2019 Golden Rule Day will be acknowledged during the April 15th City Council meeting at 5:00, with a Golden Rule Proclamation given by Mayor Lane.

- Developing stronger ties to diversity partners - Update on commissioner attendance at Phoenix Indian Center's Silver and Turquoise Ball

Ms. Cini talked about the background of the Silver and Turquoise Ball and thanked Commissioner Coe, Mayor Lane, Councilperson Korte, and Chief of Staff Rachel Smetana and two Yaqui Community members for attending.

- Support Office of Diversity outreach - Update on commissioner attendance at Phoenix Pride parade and Arizona Bike Week events

Ms. Cini gave an update on Scottsdale's participation in the Phoenix Pride Parade. She thanked Chair Mustafa for attending. Commissioners briefly discussed ideas for participating in the parade next year.

Ms. Cini gave an update on participation at the Arizona Bike week event.

- New initiatives as needed - HRC process to solicit and respond to issues relating to discrimination within Scottsdale and vote on prioritization

Ms. Cini recalled that in February, the Commission outlined recommendations on how the Human Relations Commission can respond to citizens' letters or complaints about discrimination. Mr. Hylan suggested that if the Commission is to respond directly to citizens regarding incidents, it should be done as a recommendation to City Council. Commissioners discussed ways to address incidents such as the one that occurred during the Parada del Sol this year. Suggestions were made regarding recommendations that could be made to the tourism department regarding taking a proactive approach to discourage prejudice and discrimination incidents during events.

4. Identification of Future Agenda Items

Chair Mustafa suggested that an item be agendaized to take action on amending the HRC bylaws to give permission to the Chair to respond to acute events of discrimination that happen between meetings.

Adjournment

VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER EANEMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR MUSTAFA, VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 6:06 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.